Discrete Discreet Asymptotics

Nalini Joshi

@monsoon0



Supported by the London Mathematical Society and the Australian Research Council



From Littlewood's preface to GH Hardy's Divergent Series



• From Littlewood's preface to GH Hardy's *Divergent Series*

"Abel wrote in 1828: 'Divergent series are the invention of the devil, and it is shameful to base on them any demonstration whatsoever."



From Littlewood's preface to GH Hardy's Divergent Series

"Abel wrote in 1828: 'Divergent series are the invention of the devil, and it is shameful to base on them any demonstration whatsoever."

"Then came a time when it was found that something after all could be done about them. This is now a matter of course, but in the early years of the century the subject, while in no way mystical or unrigorous, was regarded as sensational, and about the present title, now colourless, there hung an aroma of paradox and audacity."



Series $1 + \frac{1}{2!} + \frac{1}{3!} + \frac{1}{4!} + \dots$

 $1 - 1 + 1 - 1 + 1 - 1 + \dots$

 $1-\epsilon+\epsilon^2-\epsilon^3+\epsilon^4+\ldots$

 $1 + \epsilon + 2!\epsilon^2 + 3!\epsilon^3 + \dots$



 $1 + \epsilon + 2!\epsilon^2 + 3!\epsilon^3 + \dots$



Interpretation?

$$\frac{1}{1-2x} = 1 + 2x + 4x^2 + 8x^3 + \dots$$

$$x = 1$$
$$\Downarrow$$

$-1 = 1 + 2 + 4 + 8 + \dots$

GH Hardy, Divergent Series, 1949

Asymptotics is the approximation of functions in limits.

As $x \xrightarrow{\gamma} x_0$

Asymptotics is the approximation of functions in limits.

As $x \to x_0$ γ $f(x) \ll g(x) \iff \lim_{x \to x_0} \frac{f(x)}{g(x)} = 0$

Asymptotics is the approximation of functions in limits.

As $x \to x_0$ $f(x) \ll g(x) \iff \lim_{x \to x_0} \frac{f(x)}{g(x)} = 0$ $f(x) \sim g(x) \iff \lim_{x \to x_0} \frac{f(x) - g(x)}{g(x)} = 0$

Asymptotics is the approximation of functions in limits.

As $x \xrightarrow{\gamma} x_0$ $f(x) \ll g(x) \iff \lim_{x \to x_0} \frac{f(x)}{g(x)} = 0$ $f(x) \sim g(x) \iff \lim_{x \to x_0} \frac{f(x) - g(x)}{g(x)} = 0$ $f(x) = \mathcal{O}(g(x)) \iff \exists M \text{s.t.} \left| \frac{f(x)}{g(x)} \right| < M$ $\forall x \in \gamma$

Asymptotic Series

• f is said to be asymptotic to a series $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} a_n (x-x_0)^n$ iff $\forall N \in \mathbb{N}$

$$\lim_{x \to x_0} \frac{f(x) - \sum_{n=0}^N a_n (x - x_0)^n}{(x - x_0)^N} = 0$$

and we write

$$f(x) \sim \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} a_n (x - x_0)^n, \text{ as } x \to x_0$$

Asymptotic Series

• f is said to be asymptotic to a series $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} a_n (x-x_0)^n$ iff $\forall N \in \mathbb{N}$

$$\lim_{x \to x_0} \frac{f(x) - \sum_{n=0}^N a_n (x - x_0)^n}{(x - x_0)^N} = 0$$

and we write

$$f(x) \sim \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} a_n (x - x_0)^n, \text{ as } x \to x_0$$

• The series is not required to converge.

An example $u'' - u' \left(1 - \frac{1}{x}\right) = 0$

• One solution is

$$Ei(x) = \int_{-\infty}^{x} \frac{e^{t}}{t} dt$$
$$\sim \frac{e^{x}}{x} \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \frac{n!}{x^{n}}, \quad x \to +\infty$$

• Other solutions differ from this one by a constant.

$$Ei(x) + C$$

An example $u'' - u' \left(1 - \frac{1}{x}\right) = 0$

• One solution is



• Other solutions differ from this one by a constant.

Ei(x) + C

• Consider $F(x) = x e^{-x} Ei(x)$

$$F(x) \sim \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \frac{n!}{x^n} \text{ as } x \to \infty \quad \Leftrightarrow \forall N \left| \frac{F(x) - \sum_{k=0}^{N} k! / x^k}{N! / x^N} \right| \to 0$$

• Consider $F(x) = x e^{-x} Ei(x)$

$$F(x) \sim \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \frac{n!}{x^n} \text{ as } x \to \infty \quad \Leftrightarrow \forall N \left| \frac{F(x) - \sum_{k=0}^{N} k! / x^k}{N! / x^N} \right| \to 0$$
$$\sum_{n=0}^{10} \frac{n!}{100^n} = 1.0102062527748311680\dots$$

• Consider $F(x) = x e^{-x} Ei(x)$

$$F(x) \sim \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \frac{n!}{x^n} \text{ as } x \to \infty \quad \Leftrightarrow \forall N \left| \frac{F(x) - \sum_{k=0}^{N} k! / x^k}{N! / x^N} \right| \to 0$$
$$\sum_{n=0}^{10} \frac{n!}{100^n} = 1.0102062527748311680\dots$$
$$\sum_{n=0}^{100} \frac{n!}{100^n} = 1.0102062527748357112\dots$$

• Consider
$$F(x) = x e^{-x} Ei(x)$$

$$F(x) \sim \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \frac{n!}{x^n} \text{ as } x \to \infty \quad \Leftrightarrow \forall N \left| \frac{F(x) - \sum_{k=0}^{N} k! / x^k}{N! / x^N} \right| \to 0$$
$$\sum_{n=0}^{10} \frac{n!}{100^n} = 1.0102062527748311680\dots$$
$$\sum_{n=0}^{100} \frac{n!}{100^n} = 1.0102062527748357112\dots$$
$$\sum_{n=0}^{281} \frac{n!}{100^n} = 732496.06921461904157\dots$$

Truncation at least term



Truncate at the least term

$$F(x) = \sum_{n=0}^{N-1} \frac{n!}{x^n} + R_N$$

Truncation at least term



• Truncate at the least term $F(x) = \sum_{n=0}^{N-1} \frac{n!}{x^n} + R_N \quad \bullet \quad \text{Exponentially small} \\ N \text{ depends on } x$

The identification problem

• How do we distinguish

$$F(x) \sim \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \frac{n!}{x^n}$$
$$\widetilde{F}(x) \sim \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \frac{n!}{x^n} + \frac{e^{-x}C}{x}$$

in the limit $x \to +\infty$?

• E.g., if C=1 $\frac{e^{-100}}{100} = 3.7200759760208359630 \times 10^{-46}$

The identification problem

• How do we distinguish

• *Discreetly* hidden beyond all orders

$$F(x) \sim \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \frac{n!}{x^n}$$
$$\widetilde{F}(x) \sim \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \frac{n!}{x^n} + \underbrace{\frac{e^{-x}C}{x}}_{x}$$

in the limit $x \to +\infty$?

• E.g., if C=1 $\frac{e^{-100}}{100} = 3.7200759760208359630 \times 10^{-46}$ Why should we care?

Chaos

- "Does the flap of a butterfly's wings in Brazil set off a tornado in Texas?"
- To forecast future behaviour, we need to known initial states with infinite precision.
- This has become synonymous with *chaos*, but is also present in ordered, non-chaotic systems.



TC Gavin 1997 SW Pacific

Order

• The Painlevé equations, which arise as reductions of soliton equations

$$w_{\tau} + 6 w w_{\xi} + w_{\xi\xi\xi} = 0$$

$$\begin{cases} w = -2 y(x) - 2 \tau \\ x = \xi + 6 \tau^2 \end{cases}$$

$$\Rightarrow \begin{cases} w_{\tau} = -24 \tau y_x - 2 \\ w_{\xi} = -2 y_x \\ w_{\xi\xi\xi} = -2 y_{xxx} \end{cases}$$

Order

• The Painlevé equations, which arise as reductions of soliton equations

$$w_{\tau} + 6 w w_{\xi} + w_{\xi\xi\xi} = 0$$

$$\begin{cases} w = -2 y(x) - 2 \tau \\ x = \xi + 6 \tau^2 \end{cases}$$

$$\Rightarrow \begin{cases} w_{\tau} = -24 \tau y_x - 2 \\ w_{\xi} = -2 y_x \\ w_{\xi\xi\xi} = -2 y_{xxx} \end{cases}$$

$$y'' = 6 y^2 - x$$

Applications

- Electrical structures of interfaces in steady electrolysis *L. Bass, Trans Faraday Soc 60 (1964)1656–1663*
- Spin-spin correlation functions for the 2D Ising model TT Wu, BM McCoy, CA Tracy, E Barouch Phys Rev B13 (1976) 316–374
- Spherical electric probe in a continuum gas PCT de Boer, GSS Ludford, Plasma Phys 17 (1975) 29–41
- Cylindrical Waves in General Relativity S Chandrashekar, Proc. R. Soc. Lond. A 408 (1986) 209–232

- Non-perturbative 2D quantum gravity Gross & Migdal PRL 64(1990) 127-130
- Orthogonal polynomials with non-classical weight function *AP Magnus J. Comput Appl. Anal. 57* (1995) 215–237
- Level spacing distributions and the Airy kernel CA Tracy, H Widom CMP 159 (1994) 151–174
- Spatially dependent ecological models: Joshi& Morrison Anal Appl 6 (2008) 371-381
- Gradient catastrophe in fluids: Dubrovin, Grava & Klein J. Nonlin. Sci 19 (2009) 57-94

What do we know about the solutions of these equations?



General Solutions

- Movable poles
- Transcendentality of general solutions
- Special solutions
- Asymptotic behaviours



Tronquée Solutions



FIG. 3.1. Magnitude of the solution u(z) to the P_I equation in case of ICs u(0) = -0.1875, u'(0) = 0.3049, displayed over the domain z = x + iy, $-10 \le x \le 10$, $-10 \le y \le 10$.

Real Solutions

Consider P_I $w_{tt} = 6w^2 - t$ for $w(t), t \in \mathbb{R}$ 1.0 0.5 0.5 1.5 2.0 2.5 3.0 3.5 1.0 -0.5 -1.0

Hidden Solutions of P

• Solutions asymptotic to

$$\Pi_{\pm} = \left\{ (x, y) \mid x > 0, y = \pm \sqrt{x/6} \right\}$$

have formal expansions

$$y_f = \frac{x^{1/2}}{\sqrt{6}} \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{a_k}{(x^{1/2})^{5k}}$$
$$a_k = -2c((k-1)!)^2 \left(\frac{25}{(8\sqrt{6})}\right)^k$$

The coeffts a_k are important in 2D quantum gravity (Di Francesco, Ginsparg, Zinn-Justin 1994).

The Real Tritronquée

 Theorem: I unique solution Y(x) of PI which has asymptotic expansion

$$y_f = -\sqrt{\frac{x}{6}} \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{a_k}{(x^{1/2})^{5k}}, \text{ in } |\arg(x)| \le 4\pi/5$$

and

- Y(x) is real for real x
- ${\ensuremath{\, \circ }}$ Its interval of existence / contains ${\ensuremath{\mathbb R}}$
- Y(x) lies below Π_{-}
- It is monotonically decaying in *I*.

From Joshi & Kitaev Studies in Appl Math (2001)
What about global dynamics?

Perturbed Form

• In Boutroux's coordinates:

$$w_1 = t^{1/2} u_1(z), \ w_2 = t^{3/4} u_2(z), \ z = \frac{4}{5} t^{5/4} \\ \begin{pmatrix} \dot{u}_1 \\ \dot{u}_2 \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} u_2 \\ 6u_1^2 - 1 \end{pmatrix} - \frac{1}{5z} \begin{pmatrix} 2u_1 \\ 3u_2 \end{pmatrix}$$

• a perturbation of an elliptic curve as $|z|
ightarrow \infty$

$$E = \frac{u_2^2}{2} - 2u_1^3 + u_1 \implies \frac{dE}{dz} = \frac{1}{5z} (6E + 4u_1)$$

Perturbed Form

• In Boutroux's coordinates:

$$w_1 = t^{1/2} u_1(z), \ w_2 = t^{3/4} u_2(z), \ z = \frac{4}{5} t^{5/4}$$
$$\begin{pmatrix} \dot{u}_1 \\ \dot{u}_2 \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} u_2 \\ 6u_1^2 - 1 \end{pmatrix} + \frac{1}{5z} \begin{pmatrix} 2u_1 \\ 3u_2 \end{pmatrix}$$

- a perturbation of an elliptic curve as $|z|
ightarrow \infty$

$$E = \frac{u_2^2}{2} - 2u_1^3 + u_1 \implies \frac{dE}{dz} = \frac{1}{5z} (6E + 4u_1)$$

Projective Space

• What if *x*, *y* become unbounded?

• Use projective geometry:
$$x = \frac{u}{w}, y = \frac{v}{w}$$

 $[x, y, 1] = [u, v, w] \in \mathbb{CP}^2$

• The level curves of P_I are now

$$F_{\rm I} = wv^2 - 4u^3 + g_2 uw^2 + g_3 w^3$$

all intersecting at the base point [0, 1, 0].

 \Rightarrow To describe solutions, resolve the flow through this point

Resolving a base pt



From JJ Duistermaat, QRT Maps and Elliptic Surfaces, Springer Verlag, 2010

Resolution

• "Blow up" the singularity or base point:

$$f(x, y) = y^{2} - x^{3}$$
$$(x, y) = (x_{1}, x_{1} y_{1})$$
$$\Rightarrow x_{1}^{2} y_{1}^{2} - x_{1}^{3} = 0$$
$$\Leftrightarrow x_{1}^{2} (y_{1}^{2} - x_{1}) = 0$$

• Note that

$$x_1 = x, y_1 = y/x$$









Now the space is compactified and regularised.

Initial-Value Space



Now the space is compactified and regularised.

Unifying Property

The space of initial values of a Painlevé system is resolved by "blowing up" 9 points in CP² (or 8 points in P¹xP¹)



Sakai 2001

Sakai's Description I



Initial-value spaces of all continuous and discrete Painlevé equations

Sakai 2001





























Symmetric dP1

$$w_{n+1} + w_n + w_{n-1} = \frac{\alpha n + \beta}{w_n} + \gamma$$

- Consider $n \to \infty$
- General behaviours are close to elliptic functions
- Special solutions are given by power series

Joshi 1997 Vereschagin 1995

Solutions



Solution orbits of scalar dP1 on the Riemann sphere (where the north pole is infinity).

Scaling $\begin{cases} w_{2k} &= \frac{u(s)}{\epsilon^{1/2}} \\ w_{2k-1} &= \frac{v(s)}{\epsilon^{1/2}} \end{cases} \quad s = \epsilon n$

• dPI becomes

$$(v(s+\epsilon) + u(s) + v(s-\epsilon))u(s) = \alpha s + \epsilon \beta + \epsilon^{1/2} \gamma u(s)$$
$$(u(s+\epsilon) + v(s) + u(s-\epsilon))v(s) = \alpha s + \epsilon \beta + \epsilon^{1/2} \gamma u(s)$$

• Series expansions as $\epsilon \to 0$

$$u(s) \sim \sum_{m=0}^{\infty} \epsilon^{m/2} u_m(s)$$
$$v(s) \sim \sum_{m=0}^{\infty} \epsilon^{m/2} v_m(s)$$

Types of solutions

• Type A

$$u \sim \pm \sqrt{-\alpha s} + \frac{\gamma \epsilon^{1/2}}{2} \mp \frac{(4\beta - \gamma^2)\epsilon}{8\sqrt{-\alpha s}} + \dots$$

$$v \sim \mp \sqrt{-\alpha s} + \frac{\gamma \epsilon^{1/2}}{2} \pm \frac{(4\beta - \gamma^2)\epsilon}{8\sqrt{-\alpha s}} + \dots$$

• Type B

$$u = v \sim \pm \sqrt{\frac{\alpha s}{3}} + \frac{\gamma \epsilon^{1/2}}{6} \mp \pm \frac{\sqrt{3}(12\beta + \gamma^2)\epsilon}{72\sqrt{\alpha s}} + \dots$$

Late-order terms: Type A

$$u_m \sim \frac{\Lambda_1 \Gamma(\frac{m-1}{2})}{(i\pi s/2)^{\frac{m-1}{2}}} + \frac{\Lambda_2 \Gamma(\frac{m-1}{2})}{(-i\pi s/2)^{\frac{m-1}{2}}}$$
$$v_m \sim \frac{\Lambda_3 \Gamma(\frac{m-1}{2})}{(i\pi s/2)^{\frac{m-1}{2}}} + \frac{\Lambda_4 \Gamma(\frac{m-1}{2})}{(-i\pi s/2)^{\frac{m-1}{2}}}$$

• Optimal truncation

$$u(s) \sim \sum_{m=0}^{N_o} \epsilon^{m/2} u_m(s) + S_1 \Lambda_1(-i)^{s/\epsilon} + S_2 \Lambda_2 i^{s/\epsilon}$$



What about *q*-discrete Painlevé equations?

qP1

$$\Rightarrow \overline{w} \underline{w} = \frac{1}{w} - \frac{1}{\xi w^2} \quad (qP_I)$$
$$\overline{w} = w(q\xi), w = w(\xi), \underline{w} = w(\xi/q)$$

• A limiting form of qP3, rescaled

$$\overline{g} \underline{g} = \frac{\alpha x}{g} + \frac{\beta}{g^2}$$
 Ramani & Grammaticos (1996)
 $\overline{g} = g(\tilde{q} x), \underline{g} = g(x/\tilde{q})$
 \mapsto PI: $y'' = 6y^2 - t$ in continuum limit.

Singular Dynamics

• Near e_1 where $v_{11} <<1$

$$\begin{cases} \overline{u}_{11} \sim \xi(q\xi^2 u_{11} - 1), \\ \overline{v}_{11} \sim \frac{1}{\xi}, \end{cases}$$

• The flow is tangential & fast

$$\begin{cases} u_{11}(\xi) \sim C_1(q\xi_k^3)^{n-1} \\ v_{11}(\xi) \sim \frac{1}{\xi_k}, \end{cases}$$

• Result: union of e_j is a repeller.

Behaviours near fixed points

 $\overline{w} \sim w, \quad \underline{w} \sim w, \quad |\xi| \to \infty$

$$\Rightarrow w^{4} = w + \mathcal{O}(1/\xi)$$

$$\Rightarrow w = \begin{cases} \omega + \mathcal{O}(1/\xi) & \omega^{3} = 1\\ \mathcal{O}(1/\xi) \end{cases}$$

- qP_1 is invariant under rotation by argument $2\pi/3$, so ω can be replaced by unity.
- The second case lies in neighbourhood of a merger of two base points: (1/ξ,0), (q/ξ, 0).

Near unity

• Near $w=1, \ \underline{w}=1, \ \exists$ a formal series solution $w=\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} a_n \ t^n, \ a_0=1$ where

 $a_n (q^n + 1 + q^{-n})$ = $-\sum_{l=1}^{n-1} a_l a_{n-l} (q^{(2l-n)} + 1)$ $-\sum_{m=1}^{n-1} \sum_{j=0}^{n-m} \sum_{l=0}^m a_j a_{n-m-j} a_l a_{m-l} q^{(n-m-2j)}$

Near zero

• Near $w = 1/\xi, \ \underline{w} = q/\xi, \ \exists$ a formal series solution

where
$$w(\xi) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{v_n}{\xi^n}$$

$$b_1 = 1, \ b_2 = 0, \ b_3 = 0$$

$$b_n = \sum_{r=2}^{n-2} \sum_{k=1}^{r-1} \sum_{m=1}^{n-r-1} b_k b_{r-k} b_m b_{n-r-m} q^{(r-2k)}, \ n \ge 4$$

Step 1: divergence

The coefficients of the asymptotic series grow very fast:

$$b_{3p+1} = \mathcal{O}\left(|q|^{3p(p-1)/2} \prod_{k=0}^{p-1} (1+q^{-3k})^2\right), |q| > 1$$

$$b_{3p+2} = 0, \ b_{3p+3} = 0, \ \forall p \ge 0$$
Step 2: Analytic Sum

• Use of the Borel-Ritt theorem provides an analytic function W s.t.

$$W(\xi) \sim \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{b_n}{\xi^n}$$

Step 3: Linearisation

• The linearisation around W satisfies

$$\overline{P} + \left(2\frac{\overline{W}}{W} - \frac{1}{W^2 \underline{W}}\right) P + \frac{\overline{W}}{\underline{W}} \underline{P} = 0$$

which has solutions with behaviours

$$P^{\pm}(\xi) \sim q^{\pm 3 n(n \mp 5/3)/2}$$

 $\xi = \xi_0 q^n$

Step 4: True Solutions

• The perturbed q-difference equation gives

$$\begin{aligned} v_n &= \beta_0 \, P_n - P_n \, \sum_{j=n}^{n_0 - 1} \frac{W_j \, W_{j-1}}{P_j \, P_{j-1}} \, \sum_{k=k_0}^{j-1} \frac{P_k \, \mathcal{R}_2(v_k, v_{k-1}, t_k)}{W_{k+1} \, W_k} \\ \text{where} \quad & \left\| \mathcal{R}_2(v, \underline{v}, t) \right\| \le C_1 \, \|\mathbf{v}\|^2 + C_2 |t| \\ & \left\| \nabla \mathcal{R}_2 \right\| \le C_3 \, \|\mathbf{v}\| + C_4 \, |t| \end{aligned}$$

• The contraction mapping theorem provides a true solution.

Quicksilver solution

- The vanishing solution approaches two base points.
- Its series expansion is divergent.
- We prove a true solution exists with this behaviour; it does not lie on a singularity of the underlying elliptic curve. So it is different to the *tritronquée* solutions of the Painlevé equations.

 \Rightarrow new name: *quicksilver* solution

• It is unstable in initial-value space.

Joshi, Stud Appl Math (2014)

Comparison

PI

- No rational or classical solutions
- Leading-order behaviour is elliptic
- Two types of solutions described by asymptotic behaviours
- Tronquée solutions are asymptotic to a power series in a large sector

qPI

- No algebraic or solutions in terms of linear eqns *Nishioka* (2010)
- Leading-order behaviour is elliptic
- Four types of solutions described by asymptotic behaviours *J* (2014)
- Quasi-stationary solutions are asymptotic to a power series in a large region J (2014)

Summary

- New mathematical models of physics pose new questions for applied mathematics
- Global dynamics of solutions of non-linear equations, whether they are differential or discrete, can be found through geometry.
- Geometry provides the only analytic approach available in $\mathbb C$ for discrete equations.
- Tantalising questions about finite properties of solutions remain open.



The mathematician's pattern's, like those of the painter's or the poet's, must be beautiful, the ideas, like the colours or the words, must fit together in a harmonious way. *GH Hardy, A Mathematician's Apology, 1940*